



Open Access



False Consciousness in Daniyal Mueenuddin's *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders*

Bakhtawar Nasrullah¹ Fasih Ur Rehman² Maham Nawaz³

Abstract: *This research seeks to explore the false consciousness of the lower class in society that is created by the upper class in the following stories, Nawabdin Electrician, Saleema, A Spoiled Man, Provide, In Other Rooms, Other Wonders, about a Burning Girl taken from Daniyal Mueenuddin's collection of short stories In Other Rooms, Other Wonders. It investigates in detail how the proletariat's mind is controlled by the upper class by giving them false beliefs, and it also invites us to look in detail at how the lower strata are kept in disillusion in the paradigm of capitalism and how this false consciousness became the cause of the destruction of the lives of the many characters. These stories have been analyzed under the domain of Marxism. This paper will comprise the Marxist analysis of the text and it is an interpretative type of research involving the textual analysis of the proposed text. This study finds that different characters are the victims of false consciousness within the capitalist society, and this research is purely qualitative and exploratory.*

Key Words: False Consciousness, Daniyal Mueenuddin, Marxism

Introduction

The present study investigates how the lower strata are exploited by the upper strata. It also examines how the ruling class controls the lower strata by keeping them in false consciousness. This study also examines how the ruling class uses the labor power of the proletariat and how they impose their ideology on the lower class within the capitalistic society and become the cause of exploitation of the lower class. *In Other Rooms, Other Wonder's* first notable collection of short stories by Daniyal Mueenuddin was published in 2009 and converted into sixteen other languages. He received the Story Prize and the Commonwealth Prize for this work. This book is composed of eight interlinked short stories that revolve around one character K.K Harouni and all the other characters interlink with him. The setting of these stories is Punjab in the 1970s and 1990s. The author has highlighted the themes of gender roles, social mobility, class struggle, feudalism, feminism, corruption, and Marxism (Hamati-Ataya, 2015).

Literature Review

Hai, (2014) In her research Post-Colonial Servitude: Interiority And System In Daniyal Mueenuddin's *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders*, explores the domestic servitude and interiority of the servants by placing them in the central position rather than a peripheral position to restore those into the level of human treatment who are thoroughly treated as inhuman or instrument and to create a space for their voices and to examine how the servants are compelled to show obedience to the powerful elite. The researcher employs the Anglophone South Asian literary history and the feudalistic system of Pakistan in the post-colonial domain as a theoretical framework to show how the strategies of the subaltern's portrayal analyzed the interiority of a servant and displays how the power's system dehumanizes the individuality of the subaltern by locking them in the domestic enslavement.

¹ M.Phil. Scholar, Department of English, Khushal Khan Khattak University, Karak, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Paksitan.

² Lecturer in English, Department of English, Khushal Khan Khattak University, Karak, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Paksitan. Email: fasihhrkk@gmail.com

³ M.Phil. English Literature, Department of English, Riphah International University Lahore, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan. Email: mahamnawaz228@gmail.com

▪ **Corresponding Author:** Bakhtawar Nasrullah (bak325064@gmail.com)

▪ **To Cite:** Nasrullah, B., Rehman, F. U., & Nawaz, M. (2024). False Consciousness in Daniyal Mueenuddin's *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders*. *Qlantia Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*, 5(4), 123-132. <https://doi.org/10.55737/qjssh.v-iv.24040>



Tanvir (2024), in their research, *A Deconstructive Analysis Of The Short Story Saleema* by Daniyal Mueenuddin, explores how the deconstructive analysis demolished the very idea of feminism and the power dynamic between the two genders in Daniyal Mueenuddin's Short story *Saleema*. The researchers analyze the short story of Mueenuddin's *Saleema* through the perspective of post-structuralism given by Derrida to show that language is itself contradictory and not a reliable source. The researchers use the interpretive method and descriptive approach to challenge the basic idea of feminism about the insecure place of women and to reverse the polarity between males and females (Faheem, 2021).

Waheed (2017), in his research *Marxist reading of Daniyal Mueenuddin's short stories* from his book *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders*, explores the socio-economic factors that result in the oppression of society and analyzes the pragmatic changes because of this effect. The researcher employs the theory of Marxism presented by Karl Marx to show the economic instability in the character of the story (Albert, 1981). The researcher used textual analysis as a methodological framework for the three short stories from Mueenuddin's collection *in Other Room*.

Tariq, (2018), in her research *Feudal System Of Pakistan In Daniyal Mueenuddin's Short Stories: A Marxist Critique*, explores the feudalism in Mueenuddin's *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders* set in Punjab Pakistan, which illustrates a similar stratification and the struggle among the different classes studied by Marx and Engels for the capitalistic system. This study also explores the unjustness in Pakistani feudalism and gives a solution to eliminating the injustice in rural areas by creating awareness (Almas, 2019).

Theoretical Framework

A political and economic theory of Marx and Engels is a network of thought indicating the elimination of the private property of the means of production with the production of work and maintenance of livelihood for all members of society. The bourgeoisie can be defined as the capitalist class that owns the means of production and the wealth of the state and gives wages to the working class; on the other hand, the proletariat refers to the working class who do not own the mean of production, and thus they are compelled by the bourgeoisie to sell their labor power for their survival. (Marx, 1948, p.9)

According to Marx, the structure of class is based on the productive forces of society. The superstructure's component and society's culture are manipulated by the upper class to subjugate the lower class. In the class struggle, there is a conflict between the forces of production and the relation of production. And when these two things did not co-exist with one another, then the lower class became conscious that they were being exploited by the upper class. As a result, they started a protest against it, and it gave emergence to class struggle.

Capitalism, an economic system, is established upon three ideas: wage labor, means of production owned by private owners, and profit and exchange produced as a result of production. Capitalism is built on the following principle: money is invested to produce more money. It is the economic system in which the private owner controls everything and is based on competition, and government does not intervene in the activities of the people, and there is unequal distribution.

Class consciousness refers to people's awareness of their place in the economy, and they recognize themselves and who they are. After the recognition, they started the revolution, and also this revolution was a big threat to the old structure. It mostly emerged in the proletariat that they were being exploited by the upper class, and that's why they started a revolution. (Griffiths, 2021)

False consciousness can be defined as the individual or the group's false belief about themselves, the world, or the social values that hide from them visible and particular realities. It is a concept that was not used by Marx himself. This concept was first used by Engel in his letter to Mehring, and it was first theorized by George Lukacs in his book *History and Class Consciousness*. He defined this term as the belief system that is based on the false ideology that hides the true self of human conditions while presenting the history and situation as something natural, true, and eternal. (False consciousness, Hamati. 2014. Pg. 1,3)

Analysis

The present study argues that false consciousness is a tool used by the bourgeoisie against the proletariat in the novel *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders* (2009). False consciousness is such a phenomenon where the upper strata are used to brainwash the lower strata to use them for their benefit. Lower strata were made blind to the basic facts by the bourgeoisie, and they also didn't want to escape from this situation. The theoretical framework of the present study, which is about false consciousness among the characters, occurs in Marxist society. The foundation of the theoretical framework of the present study is conducted on George Lukacs's idea of false consciousness (Bowens, 1975).

Lukacs (1923) defines false consciousness about history as “It appears, on the one hand, is something which is subjectively justified in the social and historical situation is something which can and should be understood i.e as right at the same time, objectively, bypasses the essence of the evolution of society and fails to pinpoint at and express it adequately that is to say objectively it appears is a false consciousness”(60). In the above lines, subjective means individual perceptions about something. Lukacs says that individuals see the historical and social situation as something justified and consider it to be the right thing. The individual is blind to the facts, and they think that whatever is happening in society is natural. On the other hand, if we see it from an objective point of view we'll come to know that objectively it avoids the basic essence of change or revolution in society, and being unable to pinpoint the revolution correctly, means that objectively it can be called false consciousness.

Further Lukacs, (1923) claims “The two-fold dialectical determination of false consciousness constitute analysis for removed from the naïve description of what men in fact thought, felt and wanted it any moment history and from any given point in the class structure”(61). According to Lukacs, the subjective and objective determination of false consciousness is composed of such analysis where it is not explained what the feeling, thinking, and likeness of men are in history and society. It means that the lower strata feel, think, and want according to the upper strata. They do not have their own thinking. Similarly, illusion and the falseness that the bourgeoisie create is the intellectual reflex of the economic system.

Similarly, the lack of consciousness of lower strata maintains capitalism (86). The above line employs that until and unless the lower strata lack consciousness, they will never be able to abolish the capitalist system it will repeat there would be a lot of suffering and conflict among the classes and inequalities and injustice because the lower strata have no choice of their own and Marx points out that the lower strata become a class for itself and against the capitalist class. The lower strata are unable to pinpoint what is happening outside society, and in this process, they are reduced to the mouthpiece of the capitalist class and, hence, exploited by the upper strata. In short, we can say that Lukacs considers class consciousness as right and false consciousness as wrong, and it is when people are unable to see that they are being exploited and used by the upper strata.

The concept of false consciousness in the light of Marxism seems to be portrayed in the following stories including *Nawabdin Electrician*, *Saleema*, *Provide Provide*, *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders*, *About a Burning Girl*, and *A Spoiled Man* taken from a collection of short stories *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders* (2009).

The idea of false consciousness seems to be portrayed in the story of *Nawabdin Electrician* extracted from *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders* (2009). “Matter sir? O what could be the matter in your service? I've eaten your salt for all my years. But sir, on the bicycle now, with my old legs, and with the many injuries I've received when heavy machinery fell on me—I cannot any longer bicycle about like a bridegroom from farm to farm, as I could when I first had the good fortune to enter your employment. I beg you, sir, let me go” (p.16). In the above lines, the false consciousness seems to be portrayed through the character of Nawabdin. Nawabdin has come to his master, K.K Harouni in demand of a motorcycle; then he says I have eaten your salt for many years it means that he doesn't rely on his skills; he is dependent on his master, so if the master is giving something, it is in return of the work he is doing for him. By the phrase eating a salt, we can imply that Nawabdin has not recognized his skills. When he asks for a motorcycle, he says that I cannot bear the injuries anymore from traveling on the bicycle with his old legs, which means that he has turned into old age but is still working under his patron, K.K Harouni. Asking for a motorcycle can also



be interpreted as he doesn't want to get freedom from his master. Rather, he becomes himself the victim of false need.

The false consciousness seems to be more visible when he says that it was my good fortune that you gave me a job, so this idea is internalized in his mind that only the capitalist class is the sole solution for all his problems. So he says to his master, "Well, sir, if I had a motorcycle, then I could somehow limp along at least until I train up some younger man... received a brand new motorcycle, a Honda 70. He even managed to extract an allowance for gasoline" (p. 17). Receiving a brand new motorcycle blinded him to the basic reality of the economic system run by K.K Harouni. K.K Harouni fulfills his demand for a motorcycle because through the motorcycle, he is trying to keep him in his false belief so that he may not be able to turn against him.

Similarly, the false consciousness of Nawabdin seems to be depicted through his dialogues with the robber in the following line "Never, I won't forgive you. You had your life, I had mine. At every step of the road I went the right way and you the wrong. Look at you now, with bubbles of blood stuck in the corner of your mouth" (p. 28). In these lines, Nawabdin is talking to the robber in a hospital. He is asking for forgiveness, and he says I will not forgive you. We are on separate paths in life when he says that in every step of my life, I choose the right way and you the wrong. Here, the main problem is with Nawabdin, not with the robber, because the robber is free and is not working under anyone, but if we look at the character of Nawab, he is under K.K Harouni, and he is saying it right way it shows that he is under the false consciousness and is unable to recognize the inequalities of the capitalistic system.

In this story K.K Harouni Kept Nawabdin in false consciousness through money by giving him a motorcycle. He wants to sustain his power over the working class and also motorcycle blur the basic reality of Nawabdin. In this way, he is exploited by the owner K.K Harouni and he is working happily for K.K Harouni without recognizing his self.

Similarly, in the story of Saleema, taken from *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders* (2009), the same concept of false consciousness seems to be portrayed in the following lines: "He must be sixty, came into service as a boy, fifty years ago. He spent more time with the master than anyone else, woke the old man and put him to bed, brought him tea, massaged his feet, dressed him, brought him a single whisky at night"(p. 34). In the above lines, false consciousness seems to be portrayed through the character of Rafik, who is the servant of K.K Harouni. It is evident from this point that he worked for K.K Harouni from childhood till he fifty-year-old age; it shows that within these fifty years, he was unable to recognize the inequalities and therefore, he made no rebellion against his master and happily performed the work of his master by spending more time with him and take care of him. He works more, but he is not given that much money and the master controls him by giving them a small amount of money so that he may not be able to see the basic reality of his master of maintaining unequal relationships among the different classes of society.

Similarly, Rafik is shown in the false consciousness in the following lines: " Harouni Sahib is a lord, and we are poor people"(p. 40). In these lines, it is shown that Rafik is controlled by K.K Harouni through money. When he says Harouni sahib is a lord and we are poor people, it means that the upper class has internalized this idea into his mind that you people are born poor and it is something natural and the lower strata consider it as a right thing, and they didn't show any rebellion because in front of them, it is normal and they think they cannot change the situation.

Similarly, in these lines, Rafik holds a false belief: "Rafik's face broke involuntarily into a broad smile "What can I say, Harouni, life takes strange turns. There are all your Honor's blessings"(p.53). In these lines, Rafik seems to be an illusion when he says to Harouni that whatever good happens in his life is because of him. Through your honor in these lines, he has shown as a thankful to K.K Harouni. If we see him exploited by K.K Harouni, he considers it a blessing because he has not realized his actual position in society. In the actual position, Rafik has labor power, but it is blurred by K.K Harouni in the form of the price of labor power.

Similarly, in the story of *Provide Provide*, taken from *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders* (2009), the concept of false consciousness is depicted In the following lines: "My sister said Mustafa, just fled back from Rawalpindi, leaving her husband there. He works in 'Pindi as a peon in a bank. You were good enough to get him that post" (p. 65). In the above lines, it seems that the character of Mustafa is in false

consciousness when he requests his master Jaglani about the post for his sister it shows that he considers the master as the only source who can give his sister a job. Master Jaglani controlled the lower class through money. At first, Mustafa was under his control, but now he has taken his sister as a slave to him, and also, by giving a job to the people, he maintains a false consciousness among the lower strata.

It seems to be more evident in the following line: " You never ask for anything. Let me give you some money. You can buy clothes" (p. 69). The above lines show that the bourgeoisie imposed their ideology on the lower class in an unfelt way. It is shown through the character of Jaglani, who represents the bourgeoisie class and controls the lower class, like Zainab, through money. When he says that you never demand anything, it shows that Zainab was in false consciousness. She didn't show any resistance because she considered the system as the right thing, and when he offered her money, it shows that through money, he tried to keep Zainab in a false consciousness. And because of this, he exploits her, which is depicted in the following lines: "They talked of nothing, she told him of the baby's little tricks, asked him about the farm. It surprised him that she didn't ask about her future about property or money"(p.90). In these lines, Zainab has a false need for protection and food. She never asks for anything, including property or money, from his master Jaglani, and it shows that she thinks that the protection and food are enough for her, though he exploits her and she doesn't realize the inequality done by him to her. And she suffers the most because of her false consciousness.

Similarly, in the story *About a Burning Girl*, the concept of false consciousness seems to be portrayed through the character of Khadim's father in the following lines: "I've served fifty years, for the big sahib and now the small one"(p.108). khadim's father belongs to the lower class, and he says to a Judge I have worked for about fifty years for a big sahib, and now I am working for the smaller one. It shows that for about fifty years, he is in false consciousness, and he doesn't want to come out from slavery because he is blurred to the basic reality and he considers the economic system as something natural.

Similarly, in the story *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders* is taken from the collection of the short story *In Other Rooms, Other Wonder* (2009). False consciousness seems to be depicted through the character of Husna in the following lines: "Husna's mind would hang on these symbols of wealth, not letting go for hours. She sensed that all this might come to her through Harouni if she became his mistress"(p.122). In these lines, Husna holds the false belief that she can elevate her status through Harouni if she becomes his mistress. This means that she considers Harouni to be the only source through which she can change her lifestyle. In this process, she is exploited by K.K Harouni because he not only makes her do work for him but also seduces her physically, and she thinks it is the right thing. In this process, she becomes the victim of false consciousness, as shown in the following lines: "Husna Began to enjoy the advantages of her new position."(p. 133). In this line, she seems to be in a false consciousness; she enjoys her new position and considers it to be very beneficial for her, ironically the new position K.K Harouni has given to her kept her in a false idea, and she thinks that I have taken control over Harouni but deep down she is under the control of K.K Harouni and she is unable to see the exploitation, oppression of herself and it is more clear in the following lines "Did uncle say anything about me before...before Sarwat broke in. No she replied with finality. There was and is nothing for you"(p. 141). In the above lines, she seems to be an illusion when she says that her uncle has talked about her. It shows that she has this false idea that K.K Harouni will give her anything, and it is shattered when Sarwat says that he has not talked about you and that there is nothing that we can give her. In the end, she is made to leave the house, and she leaves the house without showing any rebellion because she thinks that I am poor and has nothing to do with these people.

Similarly, in the story of *A Spoiled Man* extracted from *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders* (2009). the theme of false consciousness seems to be portrayed through the character of Rezak in the following lines "Rezak laughed mirthlessly. The way I'm going, soon, I'll be eating grass. He paused. I've been thinking I can do woodwork, and I know about trees. I'll carry things and work in the garden. Feed me, and I'll work here and do whatever you want. You don't even have to give me a room, I've got a portable cubicle that I live in, you can stick me in some corner"(p. 225). In this line, the character of Rezak is in false consciousness when he says I will work for you people. And in return, you people feed me. It means that he considers whoever feeds him, and he will work for them. He is under the illusion that the master can give him food, and this food makes him blind to the basic fact that his labor power has been concealed through food. Here, Rezak is shown in a miserable situation, and he does not have anything to feed himself within the capitalistic



society. When the master gives him a nine thousand salary per month, he becomes very happy. He thinks it is enough for him. This salary further blurs the true appearance of the economic structure of the bourgeoisie, and it keeps him in a false consciousness when he says, "He wanted his family to know of his success" (p.231). In this line, he considers success to be something like having a job and feeding yourself. But ironically, it is not his success, but it is his failure to recognize inequalities and injustices done to him by the upper strata in the form of more work taken from him. The upper class has internalized in his mind that whatever happens in society is natural and is the right thing, and you should be happy with whatever you have achieved in your life. It is clear in the following lines when he says "God has been good to me, more than I deserve" (p. 231). It means that he has a false belief that God has provided me with many things, and he gives me more than I deserve further when it is said, "Rezak has not been able to resist boasting of his salary" (p. 231). This point means that he was not able to show any kind of resistance to his master to elevate his salary, and he is not showing any resistance because of his false consciousness, and he was unable to pinpoint the true nature of the capitalistic system.

Similarly, in the following line he is shown in the false consciousness: "Ghulam Rasool stepped forward. Sir she is not well in the head, this man took her from kindness as much as anything. And then our sahib is very good to us, he gives us everything we need and more" (p. 239). In this line, the character of Ghulam Rasool seems to be shown in false consciousness; it is when he says that our sahib treated us in a very good manner and provided us with everything we needed. It shows that the bourgeoisie has kept him in his false consciousness by giving him a small amount of money so that they remain an illusion and are not able to recognize the inequalities done to them.

Similarly, Ghulam Rasool served the Harouni for about fifty years, which means that he did not recognize any inequalities and injustices in society. That's why he was serving the Harouni for fifty years. In the above stories, the characters who were in the false consciousness suffer the most and lead miserable lives because they are unable to recognize the inequalities, oppressions, and exploitation of the lower class; hence, they remain the same throughout the story, and there is no change happening in their life. They were poor and remained poor throughout the stories because of false consciousness. This false consciousness made it easy for the bourgeoisie to remain powerful and rich to control the lower strata. From the above discussion, it has been concluded that Nawabddin Electrician, Rafik, Mustafa, Zainab, khadim, and his father, Husna, Rezak, and Ghulam Rasool were kept in false consciousness by the ruling class.

Labour Power

The present study argues that the bourgeoisie tries to deploy the layers of false consciousness between characters to use the skills of laborers for their benefit in the novel *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders* (2009). Lukacs (1923), the value of labor power is replaced by the price of labor, and they keep you in the illusion that the total labor power is paid, but in reality, this paid labor is unpaid (63). In the above lines, it is said that the bourgeoisie controls the lower strata through the economic system in such a way that they think that they are given proper wages, but in reality, they are exploited and are not paid the due amount which they deserve rather it is kept by the bourgeoisie for themselves.

This means that the working class has some basic skills of work that the bourgeoisie does not have, and they sell their basic skills to get a wage from the upper strata. And lower strata did not use their labor power for their benefit but for the bourgeoisie because they didn't realize their labor power. The concept of labor power seems to be depicted in the story of *Nawabddin Electrician* extracted from *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders* (2009). "Nawab tended the household machinery, the air conditioners, water heaters, refrigerator, and water pumps, like an engineer tending the boilers on a foundering steamer in an Atlantic gale" (p.15). In the above lines, Nawab, as shown, has labour power. It is when it is said that he takes care of household machinery, including the air conditioners, water, etc, like an engineer. He has these skills because he is not only an electrician but a mechanic. He unknowingly uses these skills to benefit his patron, K.K Harouni. Similarly, the labor power of Nawab is replaced by wages in the following lines: "Nawab, of course, knew that he must proliferate his sources of revenue, the salary he received from K.K Harouni for tending the tube wells would not even begin to suffice" (p.15). In the above lines, when Nawab is trying to increase his sources of income, it means that the wage he receives from his owner, K.K Harouni, is not

fulfilling his basic needs. Although he tends all the tube wells of K.K Harouni which shows his labor power this labor power is replaced by minimum wage and because of this he is kept in illusion. Nawab is unable to make use of his basic skills for the fulfillment of his basic needs because he is in false consciousness. If he works for K.K Harouni, then he will be able to raise his status.

Similarly, in the story of *Provide Provide*, the concept of labor power seems to be portrayed in the following lines: "The men would be paid a portion of their wages throughout the year in wheat, which they preferred, saying that money might be spent, but as long as they had the monthly allowance of wheat their families would not starve. At noon each day, Zainab sent out a tray of food to him, covered with a white cloth, and Jaglani ate under the breezy leaves of the banyan while the men continued to work" (p.68). In the above lines, it has been depicted that the labor power of the men is replaced by a small amount of wages. They are only given a small amount of wages once a year in wheat, and because of a monthly allowance, they can protect their family from starvation. This means that their food materials are limited. From them, more work is taken, and they don't recognize their labor power because of wages through which they are kept in false consciousness by jaglani, and hence they continue their work.

Similarly, in the story of *A Spoiled Man*, the labor power of Rezak seems to be used by the bourgeoisie for their benefit in the following lines: "There's an old man, he can't do hard labor, but he's a reliable person. His family abandoned him. He even has his portable hut, which he'll take there and live as a guard. You don't have to give him a salary, just food and a few rupees for pocket money" (p. 227). In the above lines, the labor power of Rezak has been underestimated, and his labor power has been exploited by the ruling class and replaced by a small amount of pocket money. His labor power is hidden behind the wages, and it keeps him in the illusion that you have paid the due amount, but in reality, it is unpaid.

Proletariat and Bourgeoisie

The present study argues that the false consciousness of the proletariat is beneficial for the bourgeoisie in the novel *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders* (2009). According to Lukacs (1923), In Marxism, the division of society into classes is determined by position within the process of production (56). The bourgeoisie and proletariat are the only pure classes in a Bourgeoisie society (69). This means that society is divided into two different classes, the bourgeoisie and the proletariat, and this division occurs in relation to the production process. Within the process of production, the factors of production are changed into products, which result in the different classes, including the bourgeoisie, who own the mean of production, and the proletariat, who do not own the mean of production. Similarly, Butt et al. (2022), in their research distribution should undo access: A Marxism Deconstruction *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders*, claim that the upper class has power over the lower class and the lower class must obey and do what the owner wants them to do(48). The concept of bourgeoisie and the lower strata seems to be portrayed in the following stories *Nawabdin Electrician*, *Saleema*, *Provide Provide*, *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders*, *A Spoiled Man* extracted from *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders* (2009).

It is depicted in the following lines in *Nawabdin Electrician's* story "In any case, this trick guaranteed his employment, both off and on the farm of his patron, K.K Harouni"(p.13). In the above line, the concept of bourgeoisie and proletariat seems to be depicted through the characters of Nawab and K.K Harouni. When it is said that the trick secures Nawab's employment on the farm of his owner, K.K Harouni, this means that the Nawab belongs to the proletariat, K.K Harouni belongs to the bourgeoisie, and K.K Harouni exploits it. Further, it is depicted in the following line: "Sir, as you know, your lands stretch from here to the Indus, and on these land are fully seventeen tube wells and to tend these seventeen tube wells there is but one man, me, your servant" (p.16). From these lines we can infer that K.K Harouni represent the bourgeoisie and Nawab represent proletaraite. It is shown when Nawab said to Harouni that his land stretches from here to Indus. This means that the lands are a means of production owned by Harouni, and Nawab works as a servant by tending the seventeen tube wells on the farms. So from this, we can say that Nawab, being in the false consciousness, is exploited, ed by Harouni for his benefit.

Similarly, in the story of *Saleema*, taken from *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders* (2009), this concept is more visible in the following lines "They turned onto a single-lane road, which led first through barren salt flats, then irrigated fields, and finally into an orchard of old mango trees all this belong to Main sahib, said Rafik"(p.38). In the above line, Rafik represents the proletariat, and K.K Harouni is shown as the



bourgeoisie because Rafik says that all the land and orchards are in control of K.K Haraouni. This means they are only working here and do not own these lands.

In the same manner, the concept of proletariat and bourgeoisie is also portrayed in the story *In Other Rooms, Other Wonder* taken from *In Other Rooms, Other Wonder* (2009) in the following lines "Husna needed a job she stole up the long drive to the Lahore house of the retired civil servant and landlord K.K Harouni bearing in her little lacquered fingers a letter of introduction from of all people his estranged first wife"(p.113). Here, in the above lines, when it is said that Husna needs a job, it means that she belongs to the lower class and wants a job to meet her basic needs. Therefore, she comes to the landlord, K.K Harouni, to the Lahore mansion. The word landlord shows that K.K Harouni represents the bourgeoisie class because he owns all the lands. At the end of the story, Husna is exploited by K.K Harouni because of her false consciousness.

Similarly in the story of *A Spoiled Man*, the two classes seem to be depicted in the following passage "Her husband a counter could show it to his guests and tell them about Rezak, the old man who entered service bringing his own house"(p.247). In these lines, Rezak is a member of the proletariat class, and Sonia represents the bourgeoisie class. It is depicted when Sonia says that Rezak is our servant and he came to our house in old age to do work for us. It shows that Rezak was in false consciousness because he had never realized that he had been exploited by the upper class. From the above discussion, it has been concluded that Nawabddin Electrician, Rafik, Saleema, Husna, and Rezak belong to the proletariat; on the other hand, K.K Harouni, Sohail Harouni, and his wife belong to the bourgeoisie.

Capitalism

The present study argues that capitalism manipulates the false consciousness among the characters to maintain their power in the collection of short stories *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders* (2009). Lukacs, (1923). claims most normal shifts in perspective produced by the capitalist point of view in the image of the economic structure of society tend to obscure and mystify the true origin of surplus value (75). It means that the capitalist class designed the economic structure in such a way that it deteriorates and conceals the true origin of surplus value because the lower strata are unable to observe the real system of an economy run by capitalism. In the above lines, the capitalist class kept the lower strata away from the economic system because it is the only tool through which they can maintain their power, and the lower strata are kept in illusions by giving them minimum wages and the profit from the surplus value is received by capitalists. The capitalists conceal the true origin of the economic system from the lower strata because they fear that if these people come to know about the real economic system, then they will not submit to slavery (Marx, 2016).

It means that within the capitalistic system, the lower class is controlled and it is based on competition where there is an unequal distribution of wealth because the profit only comes in the hands of the bourgeoisie, not the working class. Sahito et al. (2021) in their research argues that the class system is the root cause of exploitation and that private ownership creates inequalities among the different classes(2).

The idea of capitalism seems to be depicted in the story of *Nawabddin Electrician*, extracted from *In Other Rooms, Other Wonder* (2009) in the following lines "K.K Harouni rarely went to his farms, but lived mostly in Lahore"(p.15). From these lines, we can infer that the capitalist class enjoys and does not work; they only receive a profit; we have the character of K.K Harouni, who mostly stays in Lahore and does not go to his farms. The capitalist class only cares about their comfort, and the working class puts their effort in the work day and night and is hence exploited by the upper class. It means that within the capitalistic society, K.K Harouni, who belongs to the capitalist class, has designed an economic system where he is only enjoying the working class people who work on the farms, and this system is hidden from the lower class. It can also be seen in these lines spoken by Nawab to his patron K.K Harouni: "Sir, as you know, your land stretch from here to Indus and on these lands are fully seventeen tube wells and to tend these seventeen tube wells there is but one man, me your servant. In your service, I have earned these gray hairs"(p.16). Capitalism seems to be depicted when Nawab says that on your farm, there are seventeen tube wells, and I am tending all those tube wells as your servant, and my hair turns a gray color. It means that the land and tube well are private property owned by K.K Hournai, and he is only receiving the profit from Nawab more work is taken, and he is exploited till his old age. Also, there is an unequal distribution of wealth

because Nawab only receives a minimum wage although he works hard and it is due to false consciousness that Nawab never comes out of his lower class.

The theme of capitalism can also be seen in the story of *Saleema* taken from *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders* (2009). In the following lines: "I beg your pardon, sir, about the maid Saleema, who has been serving the Begum Kamila. She is a poor girl, and her husband is sick. She is useful in the kitchen. She makes chapattis. If you can give her a place, it would be a blessing" (p.45). These lines depict that within the capitalist system, the working class depends on their owners. It is when Rafik, the But, asked K.K Harouni about Saleema's job, as a day that she would cook for him and that if you could give her a job, it would be a blessing. So from these lines, we can infer that Rafik, because of holding a false belief, was exploited by the upper class. Capitalism seems to be depicted in the story of *provide* through the character of Jaglani in the following lines: "Jaglani sat much of the day in the Dera on a charpoy under a massive banyan tree smoking a hookah and watching the trolley come in "(67). In these lines, Jaglani, a member of the capitalist class, is enjoying sitting on a charpoy under a banyan tree and smoking hoo. He is living a very comfortable life and is only observing the working class on the farm.

It is also portrayed in the story of *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders*, in the following lines: "In this world, some families rise and some fall, she said, and now I have come to you for help. I am poor and need a job"(114). These lines fully satisfied the idea of capitalism that rich people got rich, and the poor got poorer. Some families' rise means that only the rich can rise and the poor can't rise economically. When Husna said that I belonged to a poor family and I needed a job and had come for help. It shows that she considers the capitalist class as the only solution who can help her and they can give her a job. The Rise and fall also mean that the fall of the poor is the rise of the rich. Falls also mean the exploitation of the lower class by the upper class. Husna was in a false consciousness. That's why she came to K.K Harouni for help, and she thought that only the upper strata could give her a job. And this is manipulated by Harouni in her mind so that he can control her.

Conclusion

False consciousness is a concept that has its roots in Marx's theory, but it was theorized by George Lukacs. False consciousness refers to when the working class holds a false belief and is unable to recognize the inequality, injustice, and exploitation in the capitalistic society done by the ruling class. From the above study, it has been concluded that it will prove helpful for the reader to know about how in a capitalistic society, the working class is exploited in an unfelt way and also challenge the inequality and injustice that occur in the society and also to eliminate the injustice and to create a consciousness among the working class so that they may not be exploited by the ruling class.

This study has concluded that it fills the gap of the previous researcher and also selected Six short stories from *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders* (2009) which are relevant to the main objective of this study. The present study has been analyzed with the help of textual analysis. It has been concluded that the text of *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders* have been analyzed under the framework of Marxism (McKee, 2003).

The present study clarifies that the concept of false consciousness has been depicted in different stories, including *Nawabddin Electrician*, *Saleema*, *Provide*, *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders*, and *A Spoiled Man*. In *The Nawabddin Electrician*, the concept of false consciousness is portrayed through Nawab's character. Nawab has been exploited by K.K Harouni in an unfelt way. If we see in one of the events when he demanded a motorcycle from K.K Harouni, then K.K Harouni fulfilled this demand. Here, it has been depicted how the upper class makes the mind of the lower class, and hence, it becomes the cause of their destruction.

References

- Albert, M., & Hahnel, R. (1981). *Marxism and socialist theory*. South End Press.
- Almas, D. N., & Akhtar, D. A. (2019). Subaltern Women Shadows of the Other in *In Other Rooms Other Wonders*. *Journal of Gender and Social Issues*, 18(2). <https://jgsi.fjwu.edu.pk/jgsi/article/view/241>
- Bowens, T., Carral, Ben, Dowell, L, Everett, E., Fry, J., Hales, L., David, M., Caleb, & Strobino, D. (1975). *What Is Marxism All About? World View Forum*. Newyork.



- Butt, S. A., Qasim, Z., & Javed, M. (2022). Distribution should undo Excess: A Marxian Deconstruction of In Other Rooms, Other Wonders. *International Journal of Linguistics and Culture*, 3(2), 43–67. <https://doi.org/10.52700/ijlc.v3i2.117>
- Faheem, A. (2021). An Analytical Study of Women Objectification in In Other Rooms, Other Wonders. *University of Chitral Journal of Linguistics and Literature*, 5(II), 49–62. <https://doi.org/10.33195/ev4r4296>
- Griffiths, R. (2021). *Introducing Marxism the Communist Party*. London.
- Hai, A. (2014). Post-colonial Servitude: Interiority and System in Daniyal Mueenuddin's In Other Rooms, Other Wonders. *Ariel: A Review of International English Literature*, 45(3), 33–73. <https://doi.org/10.1353/ari.2014.0024>
- Hamati-Ataya, I. (2015). *False consciousness*. *Encyclopedia of Political Thought*. Wiley Blackwell.
- Lukacs, G. (1923). *History And Class Consciousness*. Merlin Press. London
- Marx, K. (2016). Economic and philosophic manuscripts of 1844. In *Social theory re-wired* (pp. 152–158). Routledge
- Marx, K., Engel., & Friedrich. (1848). *The Communist Manifesto*. Progress Publishers, Moscow
- McKee, A. (2003). *Textual analysis: A beginner's guide*. SAGE Publications.
- Mueenuddin, D. (2009). *In other rooms, other wonders*. WW Norton & Company.
- Sahito, I. A., Samejo, N., Magsi, U., Maher, S. A., & Magsi, M. R. (2021). Marxist (Capitalist) Approach in Pakistani English short stories Nawabuddin Electrician by Daniyal Mueenuddin and God be praised by Ahmed Nadeem Qasmi. *Psychology and Education*, 58(5), 1553–6939. <https://psychologyandeducation.net/pae/index.php/pae/article/view/6114>
- Tanvir, O. (2024). A Deconstructive Analysis Of The Short Story “Saleema” By Daniyal Mueenuddin. *University of Chitral Journal of Linguistics and Literature*, 1(I), 60–70. <https://doi.org/10.33195/>
- Tariq, H. (2018). Feudal System Of Pakistan In Daniyal Mueenuddin's short Stories: A Marxist Critique. *Linguistic And Literature Review*. 4(1), 32–39. https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=3825397
- Waheed, K. (2017). Marxist Reading Of Daniyal Mueenuddin's short Stories Of His Book *In Other Room Other Wonders*. *An International Journal In English*. 8(VIII) 287–295.